

Full Length Research Paper

The effect of inter cross-inoculation host group rhizobia on the growth and nitrogen fixation of Faba Bean (*Vicia faba* L.) varieties in North Showa, Amhara Regional State, Ethiopia

Amha Gebremariam^{1*} and Fassil Assefa²¹College of Natural and Computational Science, P. O. Box 667, Wachemo University, Hossana, Ethiopia.²College of Natural Science, Microbial, Cellular and Molecular Biology Program Unit, P. O. Box 1176, Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

Received 16 November, 2017; Accepted 20 December, 2017

Faba bean (*Vicia faba* L.) is one of the most widely cultivated leguminous crops grown in the Highlands of Ethiopian. This study was aimed at evaluating the effect of *Rhizobium leguminosarum* *bv.viciae* isolates from other cross-inoculation hosts from field pea, grass pea, and lentil on faba bean varieties. Thus, 12 isolates were selected from faba bean, field pea, grass pea and lentil using host trap method on soil samples that was collected from North Shoa. All isolates were tolerated to pH (5 to 9), salt concentration (1 to 2%), and at a temperature of (15 to 35°C). Cross-inoculation experiments were conducted in the greenhouse to test the effects of *R. leguminosarum* isolates from faba bean, field pea, grass pea and lentil hosts on Hachallu and Wolki varieties of faba bean. The mean nodule number, nodule dry weight and mean shoot dry weight of the inoculated plants showed variations among the different cross inoculants ($p < 0.01$). Symbiotic effectiveness varied from a minimum of 64% on Hachallu variety inoculated by isolate AUFBR5 (faba bean) and 52% on Wolki variety by isolate AUFPR1 (field pea) association to a maximum of 98% in Hachallu variety inoculated with isolate AUGPR13 (grass pea), and 117% in Wolki variety inoculated with isolate AUFBR5 (faba bean). The study showed physiological and symbiotic diversity of *R. leguminosarum* isolates of faba bean, field pea, grass pea and lentil. The effective isolates that have been tested with Hachallu and Wolki varieties at green house level should be re-tested under field conditions to ascertain their performance *in vivo*.

Key words: Field pea, grass pea, lentil, symbiotic effectiveness.

INTRODUCTION

Legumes are one of the most diverse plants on earth which widespread in tropics and temperate zones (Tran

and Nguyen, 2009). Leguminosae family comprises 800 genera and 20,000 species, and represents the third

*Corresponding author. E-mail: gamha1921@gmail.com.

largest family of flowering plants (Siddique et al., 2012). Faba bean (*Vicia faba*) is one of the major cold season food crops grown in Ethiopian Highlands (CSA, 2005). Faba bean has different functions such as providing food and feed that is rich in protein improve soil fertility by symbiotic N₂ fixation with *Rhizobium*, diversifying the cropping system with crop rotation by reducing constraints on growth and yield of other crops (Nikfarjam and Aminpanah, 2015).

Ethiopia is the world's second-largest faba bean producer next to China (Salunkhe and Kadam, 1989) with annual production of 2,671,834.45 ton from 1,558,422.02 ha of land (CSA, 2015). However, the productivity of faba bean in Ethiopia is still, far below its potential due to biotic and abiotic factors (Yohannes, 2000). Amongst the various limiting factors affecting plant growth and productivity, nitrogen deficiency in soil is one of the most common factors for a reduction in yield of legume crops such as faba bean particularly in Ethiopia (Adler, 2008). The supply of nitrogen into the soil must be sufficient to increase the yield of plants (Ihsanullah et al., 2008). Chemical nitrogen fertilizers are very expensive and had an adverse effect on the environment and human health. Hence, there is an urgent need to realize a vital and cheaper source of fertilizers having an eco-friendly approach. Biological nitrogen fixation with rhizobia-legumes symbiosis is one of the alternative solutions and the promising technologies (People, 1995).

Faba bean is the most effective nitrogen fixer of all cool-season pulse crops grown in association with root nodule bacteria (*Rhizobium leguminosarum* bv. *viciae*) (McVicar et al., 2005). Faba bean is nodulated by *Rhizobium leguminosarum* bv. *Viciae* that derives the highest percentage (96% Ndfa) of nitrogen from the atmosphere (Lopez-Bellido et al., 2006). Jensen et al. (2010) reported that the crop comes after faba bean benefits up to 100 to 200 kg N ha⁻¹. It has been reported that the rhizobium inoculation increases the production and protein content of faba bean (Giller, 2001).

The specific rhizobium that nodulates faba bean is *Rhizobium leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* which also cross-nodulates field pea, grass pea, and lentils (McVicar et al., 2005). The finding showed that *Rhizobium* strain that is effective in nitrogen fixation in association with one plant species may also be effective with certain other legumes (Amara, 1990). This is demonstrated by isolates of pea and faba bean able to form nodules and fix nitrogen with faba bean host (Laguette et al., 2003). However, due to the influence of host plant on diversity and the genetic structure, *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* reflect differences in the degree of host specificity and effectiveness of nitrogen fixation within the *viciae* tribe cross-inoculation group (Handley et al., 1998).

In Ethiopia, research was conducted on cool season legumes such as faba bean, lentil, and field pea (Hailemariam and Tsigie, 2006). However, most of the studies were limited to isolation, identification, and

characterization of rhizobial isolates from faba bean in different parts of the country (Belay and Assefa, 2011). As a result, there is lack of sufficient information about cross-inoculation of rhizobia isolated from nodules of *viciae* tribe cross-inoculation group for their effectiveness in faba bean varieties. Hence, this study was directed to isolate and evaluate the effectiveness of inter cross-inoculation host group rhizobia on the growth and nitrogen fixation of faba bean (*Vicia faba* L.) varieties under greenhouse condition.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Sample collection

Soil samples were collected from twenty sites in North Shoa Zone of Amhara Region, Ethiopia. From each site, two farmer fields were selected and samples from 10 to 15 cm depth were pooled and collected in alcohol sterilized polyethylene plastic bags. Types of legumes on the soil field were Faba bean, Field pea, Grass pea and lentil (Table 1). The soil samples were brought to Applied Microbiology Laboratory of Addis Ababa University for further processing. The Seeds of Wolki and Hachallu varieties of faba bean (*Vicia faba*), Adi variety of field pea (*Pisum sativum*), and Alemaya variety of lentil (*Lens culinaris*) were provided by Holeta Agricultural Research Center whereas Wasse variety of grass pea (*Lathyrus sativus*) was gotten from Debrezeit Agricultural Research Center (Table 1).

Isolation of *Rhizobium* from nodules

The soil samples were filled into 3 kg capacity plastic pots. The seeds of faba bean (*Vicia faba*), field pea (*Pisum sativum*), lentil (*Lens culinaris*) and grass pea (*Lathyrus sativus*) were surface sterilized and sown in each pot under greenhouse conditions. After 45 days, the pink and undamaged nodules were collected and surface sterilized (Lupwayi and Haque, 1994). Nodules were crushed with alcohol flamed sterile glass rod (Somasegaren and Hoben (1994). A loopful of crushed nodule saps were streaked on Yeast Extract Mannitol Agar (YEMA) plates and incubated at 28±2°C for 3 to 5 day. According to Somasegaren and Hoben (1994), Yeast Extract Mannitol Agar (YEMA) medium of volume 1000 ml consists of the following components (g/l):

Mannitol, 10; K₂HPO₄, 0.5; MgSO₄ .7H₂O, 0.2; NaCl, 0.1; Yeast Extract, 0.5; Agar, 15.

The purity and uniformity of colony types were carefully examined through repeated re-streaking. Pure culture was preserved on YEMA slant containing 0.3% (W/V) CaCO₃ at 4°C for future use (Jordan, 1984).

Presumptive tests and designation of the isolates

The growth of isolates was evaluated on the peptone-glucose agar medium (Lupwayi and Haque, 1994). The purity of isolates was tested on Congo -Red (CR-YEMA) (Somasegaren and Hoben, 1994). All the isolates were gram stained, and their shapes and gram reaction were observed microscopically for rapid means of identification of contaminants as indicated in Lupwayi and Haque (1994). All the isolates were designated at Addis Ababa University Grass pea Rhizobia (AUGPR), Addis Ababa University Field pea

Table 1. Sites of soil sample collection and the types of legumes on the soil field.

S/N	Sample sites	Collection zones	Types of legumes on the soil field
1	Cheki	North Shoa	Faba bean
2	Bedeyo	»	Faba bean
3	Jajo	»	Faba bean
4	Kulso	»	Faba bean
5	Dalota	»	Faba bean
6	Kulso	»	Field pea
7	Dalota	»	Field pea
8	Cheki	»	Field pea
9	Bedeyo	»	Field pea
10	Jajo	»	Field pea
11	Segeda	»	lentil
12	Amino	»	lentil
13	Adadi	»	lentil
14	Hawi	»	lentil
15	Folle	»	lentil
16	Adadi	»	Grass pea
17	Hawi	»	Grass pea
18	Folle	»	Grass pea
19	Amino	»	Grass pea
20	Segeda	»	Grass pea

Rhizobia (AUFPR), Addis Ababa University Faba bean Rhizobia (AUFBR), and Addis Ababa University Lentil Rhizobia (AULR) representing each isolate.

Authentication of isolates on sand culture

In order to test the definitive purity of all rhizobial isolates, nodulation test was carried out for each of the purified isolates. They were inoculated into the host plant potted into 3 kg capacity plastic pots containing sterilized and nitrogen free sand (Somasegaren and Hoben, 1994). The sand was thoroughly washed with sulfuric acid whereas the pots were surface sterilized with 95% ethanol. Six seeds were sown in each pot and thinned down to three after germination. Each isolate was inoculated into Erlenmeyer flask for 3 days, and 1 ml of the culture suspension was inoculated into each seedling. The control plants were fertilized with 100 ml of 0.05% KNO₂ once every week. All plants were irrigated with N-free medium nutrients four times in their life (Broughton and Dilworth, 1971).

Morphological and cultural characterization of isolates

Colony morphology was characterized on YEMA as indicated in Martinez-Romero et al. (1991). The ability of isolates to produce acid/alkaline evaluated in the YEMA medium containing bromothymol blue (BTB) (0.025w/v) (Jordan, 1984). The growth rate of the isolates was determined as described by White (1995).

Physiological characteristics of isolates

Tolerance to acidity and alkalinity of each isolate was evaluated on YEMA media adjusted to pH levels of 4, 4.5, 5, 5.5, 6, 6.5, 7, 7.5, 8, 8.5, 9, 9.5, 10, 10.5, 11 and 12 (Bernal and Graham, 2001). The

ability of the rhizobial isolates tolerance to NaCl was tested by streaking on YEMA plates containing 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9 and 10% NaCl (w/v) as indicated in Bernal and Graham (2001). The growths of isolates were evaluated on YEMA plates at a different incubation temperature of 15°C, 20°C, 25°C, 30°C, 35°C, 40°C and 45°C (Lupwayi and Haque, 1994).

Cross-inoculation and symbiotic effectiveness test on sand culture

Rhizobial isolates of faba bean, field pea, grass pea, and lentil were selected as representative on the basis of the agronomic and economic importance of their legume host in the country (Table 2). They tested for their ability to form nodules and effective symbiosis with Hachalu and Wolki varieties of faba bean (*Vicia faba*). The sand was washed with sulfuric acid and autoclaved for sterilization whereas pots were surface sterilized with 95% ethanol (Lupwayi and Haque, 1994). The seeds of Hachalu and Wolki varieties of *Vicia faba* were rinsed in 95% ethanol for 10 s, and surface sterilized in 3% (v/v) solution of sodium hypochlorite for 3 min (Lupwayi and Haque, 1994).

Seeds were washed with sterile distilled water and planted into each pot. Starter cultures of selected test isolates were grown in test tubes containing 10 ml YEM broth on an orbital shaker for 3 days. 1 ml YEM broth culture of each test isolates was transferred into 100 ml sterilized YEM broth in 250 ml Erlenmeyer flask, and placed on an orbital shaker for 4 days. 1 ml of each 4 days of YEM broth culture was inoculated on to the base of seedlings of *Vicia faba* according to Vincent (1970).

The treatments were arranged in a randomized complete block design in triplicate. After 45 days of growth, the whole plants were carefully uprooted to determine modulation number, nodule dry weight, and shoot dry mass according to Vincent (1970) (Table 2). The shoots dry weight was determined as described by Somasegaren and Hoben (1994). The effectiveness of the isolates

Table 2. Selected isolates from viceae tribe host legumes for cross-inoculation test.

S/N	Isolates	Site	Host of isolates
1	AUFBR2	Bedyo	Faba bean
2	AUFBR3	Jajo	Faba bean
3	AUFBR5	Daloda	Faba bean
4	AUFPR6	Kulso	Field pea
5	AUFPR7	Dalota	Field pea
6	AUFPR10	Jajo	Field pea
7	AUGPR12	Amino	Grass pea
8	AUGPR13	Adadi	Grass pea
9	AUGPR14	Segeda	Grass pea
10	AULR16	Adadi	Lentil
11	AULR17	Hawi	Lentil
12	AULR18	Fole	Lentil

in accumulating plant shoot dry matter was calculated as described in Mulongoy (2004).

$$\%SE = \frac{\text{Inoculated plant DM} - \text{N-fertilized plant DM}}{\text{N-fertilized plant DM}} \times 100$$

Where, DM = dry matter, N= nitrogen, SE= symbiotic effectiveness. The rate of nitrogen-fixing effectiveness is evaluated as highly effective > 80%, Effective from 50 to 80%, lowly effective 35 to 49% and infective <35%.

Data analysis

Symbiotic effectiveness parameters such as nodule number, nodule dry weight, and shoot dry weight data were analyzed by one-way ANOVA (Tukey's HSD test) SPSS (Somasegaran and Hoben, 1994).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Presumptive test of isolates

In this particular study, 20 isolates from faba bean, field pea, grass pea and lentil using host trap method on soil samples were collected from North Shoa. They were authenticated and characterized on the basis of their different phenotypic and symbiotic characteristics. None of the isolates grew on peptone-glucose-agar (PGA). Similarly, Somasegaran and Hoben (1994) stated that PGA does not allow the growth of rhizobia. All isolates were gram-negative and rod-shaped bacteria with no absorption of Congo-red from the YEM-CR medium (Jordan, 1984).

Authentication and relative effectiveness of rhizobia isolates on sand culture

On the basis of the nodule formation and symbiotic

effectiveness of isolates in their respective host, nodule number, nodule dry weight and shoot dry weight were determined. All of the isolates except AUFBR4 (faba bean) and AUGPR11 (grass pea) were authenticated as root nodule bacteria from sand culture on the host plants according to Vincent (1970) and Brockwell (1998) (Table 3). The failure to re-nodulation could emanate from loss of symbiotic plasmids (Sym-plasmids) that govern the symbiotic interaction between the two partners (Zhang et al., 2001). As a result, those isolate that failed to re-modulate with their parent host may be due to other intruding bacteria that penetrated The shoots dry weight was determined as described by Somasegaran and Hoben (1994). The effectiveness of the isolates

Morphological and cultural characterization of isolates

Colony morphology, colony diameter, acid-base reaction and generation time were used to evaluate the diversity of the test isolates. The different isolates showed variations amongst one another in their characteristics (Table 4). Isolates were fast growers with large mucoid and watery texture, and colony diameter of 2.5 to 6mm, the generation time of 1.0 to 4.3 h. They changed YEMA-BTB into yellow. Several works showed that *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* nodulating faba bean (Adamu et al., 2001; Shimekit et al., 2008) were identified as fast-growing root nodule bacteria. Since they were isolated from faba bean, field pea, grass pea and lentil, they were also characterized as a cross nodulating group of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* (Jordan, 1984).

Physiological characteristics of rhizobial isolates

The inhibitory effect of salt concentrations varied among isolates of faba bean, field pea, grass pea and lentil (Table 5). The result indicated that the percentage of tolerance continued to decrease as the concentrations of NaCl increases. All 100% of the isolates grew at 1 to 2% salt concentrations. Some isolates which included AUFBR2 (faba bean), AUGPR13 and AUGPR14 (grass pea) were found to grow at all tested salt (1 to 10%) levels of concentrations as described in Adal (2009). Adal (2009) work on grass pea rhizobia reported that some isolates of *R. leguminosarum* can survive in the presence of extremely high levels of salt concentrations up to 13% of NaCl. In contrast, Teshome (2006) reported that faba bean isolated strains of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *Viciae* managed to grow at up to 6% NaCl from the Northern Ethiopia.

Isolates were grown at a different range of pH (pH 4-12) (Table 5). All isolates were tolerant to pH 5 to 9 according to Demissie (2006). Demissie (2006) reported that the *R. leguminosarum* biovar *Viciae* of *Vicia faba* and *Pisum sativum* from Northwestern Ethiopia grew at pH more than 4.75. Isolates AUFBR5 (faba bean),

Table 3. Authentication and relative effectiveness of rhizoidal isolates.

Isolates	Site	Host	Nodule number/ plant	Nodule dry weight/plant (mg)	Shoot dry weight/plant (g)	Percentage (%) SE	Effectiveness
AUFBR1	Cheki	Faba bean	25±2.88b	6±0.001 ^a	2.8±0.12 ^a	76	E
AUFBR2	Bedeyo	"	70±5.77 ^c	89±0.006 ^b	3.01±0.11 ^{bc}	83	HE
AUFBR3	Jajo	"	118±6.11 ^e	90±0.004 ^b	3.17±0.05 ^{cd}	87	HE
AUFBR4	Kulso	"	-	-	1.50±0.10 ^a	41	LE
AUFBR5	Dalota	"	90±5.77 ^d	88±0.006 ^b	3.52±0.18 ^d	96	HE
(+)Control	"	"	-	-	3.65±0.09 ^{de}		
AUFPR6	Kulso	Field pea	105±5.51 ^d	37±0.009 ^c	1.13±0.40 ^a	73	E
AUFPR7	Dalota	"	120±2.65 ^d	54±0.006 ^d	1.56±0.28 ^a	101	HE
AUFPR8	Cheki	"	25±5.13 ^b	10±0.001 ^{ab}	1.01±0.31 ^a	65	E
AUFPR9	Bedeyo	"	20±5.29 ^b	7±0.001 ^{ab}	0.54±0.37 ^a	35	LE
AUFPR10	Jajo	"	85±8.66 ^c	21±0.009 ^{bc}	1.36±0.72 ^a	88	HE
(+) Control	-	"	-	-	1.55±0.04 ^a		
AUGPR11	Hawi	Grass pea	-	-	0.09±0.02 ^a	36	LE
AUGPR12	Amino	"	67±8.54 ^b	47±0.006 ^c	0.16±0.02 ^{bc}	64	E
AUGPR13	Adadi	"	90±7.21 ^b	62±0.002 ^d	0.20±0.01 ^{cd}	81	HE
AUGPR14	Segeda	"	135±18.87 ^c	86±0.006 ^e	0.21±0.02 ^{cd}	84	HE
AUGPR15	Folle	"	24±4.16 ^a	35±0.002 ^b	0.11±0.01 ^{ab}	44	LE
(+) Control	"	"	-	-	0.25±0.29 ^d		
AULR16	Adadi	lentil	30±7.64 ^b	15±0.002 ^b	0.06±0.010 ^a	55	E
AULR17	Hawi	"	18±4.04 ^{bc}	2±0.001 ^a	0.07±0.02 ^a	64	E
AULR18	Folle	"	55±4.58 ^d	17±0.003 ^b	0.1±0.01 ^a	91	HE
AULR19	Amino	"	16±3.28 ^{ab}	2±0.001 ^a	0.05±0.01 ^a	45	LE
AULR20	Segeda	"	18±4.73 ^{bc}	6±0.006 ^{bc}	0.06±0.11 ^a	55	E
(+) Control	-	"	-	-	0.11±0.01 ^a	-	-

Table 4. Morphological and cultural characteristics of selected isolates from faba bean, field pea, grass pea and lentil.

Isolates	Collection site	Host of isolates	Colony diameter	Colony morphology	Mean generation time (MGT) (h)
AUFBR2	Benyo	Faba bean	4	LM, translucent	1.3
AUFBR3	Jajo	Faba bean	4.5	LW, transparent	2.6
AUFBR5	Daloda	Faba bean	6	LW, transparent	1.7
AUFPR6	Kulso	Field pea	3	LM, translucent	3.3
AUFPR7	Dalota	Field pea	2.5	LW, transparent	2.9
AUFPR10	Jajo	Field pea	4.1	LM, translucent	4
AUGPR12	Amino	Grass pea	2.5	LM, translucent	3.9
AUGPR13	Adadi	Grass pea	5.1	LM, translucent	2.2
AUGPR14	Segeda	Grass pea	3.3	LM, translucent	2.8
AULR16	Adadi	Lentil	3	LW, transparent	4.3
AULR17	Hawi	Lentil	3.3	LM, translucent	1.9
AULR18	Fole	Lentil	4	LM, translucent	1.0

NS=north Shoa, LM= Large mucoid, LW= Large watery.

AUFPR6 (field pea), AUGPR12, AUGPR13, AUGPR14 (grass pea) and AULR18 (lentil) were able to grow at pH 4, in contrast with Keneni et al. (2010). Keneni et al. (2010) showed that faba bean rhizobia from Wollo, Northern Ethiopia, could not tolerate pH 4. Isolates

AUFBR5 (faba bean), AUGPR13 (grass pea) and AUGPR14 (grass pea) showed a wide range of pH tolerance (pH 4 to 12).

The isolates developed within a varied range of temperature 5 to 45°C (Table 5). All the isolates (100%)

Table 5. Physiological properties of Isolates from faba bean, field pea, grass pea, and lentil.

Isolates	Host	Range of salt (%)	Range of pH	Range of T (°C)
AUFBR2	Faba bean	1-10	4.5-12	5-40
AUFBR3	Faba bean	1-3	4.5-9	5-45
AUFBR5	Faba bean	1-6	4-12	10-35
AUFPR6	Field pea	1-8	4-9.5	15-35
AUFPR7	Field pea	1-7	5-12	5-35
AUFPR10	Field pea	1- 2	4.5-11	15-40
AUGPR12	Grass pea	1-3	4-10.5	5-45
AUGPR13	Grass pea	1-10	4-12	10-40
AUGPR14	Grass pea	1-10	4-12	5-45
AULR16	Lentil	1-7	5-11	15-35
AULR17	Lentil	1-4	4.5-9.5	15-40
AULR18	Lentil	1-9	4-11	5-45

grew well between 15 and 35°C as reported in (Belay (2006), Amsalu (2007), Tesfaye (2008) and some isolates were found to tolerate 5°C of temperature. This result correlated with (Belay (2006) and Tesfaye (2008) from faba bean isolates, Fano (2010) on field pea and Adal (2009) from grass pea. They also reported that the tolerance of some *R. leguminosarum biovar viciae* isolates at 4, 5, and 10°C.

In this study, isolates AUFBR3 (from faba bean), AUGPR12, AUGPR14 (from grass pea) and AULR18 (from lentil) without a field pea isolates were tolerated with high temperature of 45°C as described by Adal (2009) on grass pea rhizobia in contrast with earlier works on cool season food legumes (Gebremariam, 2007) on faba bean and (Amsalu, 2007; Fano, 2010) on field pea rhizobia (Table 5).

Cross-inoculation and symbiotic effectiveness test

The cross-inoculation of hachallu and wolki varieties of faba bean (*Vicia faba*) with isolates from viceae variety hosts were determined. The ability to form nodules and enough nitrogen of the isolates were evaluated on the basis of nodule number, nodule dry weight and shoot dry weight as described by Brockwel (1998). All of the rhizobial isolates from faba bean, field pea, grass pea, and lentil were successfully cross inoculated and formed nodules on two varieties of Faba bean (*Vicia faba*). The result correlated with the work of McVicar et al. (2005) who reported that *R. leguminosarum bv. viciae* have broad host range than cross-nodulate field pea, lentils, grass pea and faba bean.

Nodules number ranged between 45 to 131 and 41 to 122 nodules/plant on Hachallu and wolki varieties respectively. The highest number of nodule/ plant (131) was recorded on Hachallu variety inoculated with isolate AUGPR14 (grass pea) and 122 nodules/plant on wolki variety inoculated with isolate AUFBR5 (faba bean). The least number of nodules (45 nodules/pl) was recorded

from plants inoculated with isolate AUFPR6 (field pea) from Hachallu variety and 41 nodules/plant from wolki variety inoculated with isolate AUGPR13 (grass pea) (Table 6).

The finding showed that strains isolated from viceae tribe's cross-inoculation group were able to form nodules with faba bean plant but, the number, color, and shape of nodule varied according to the strain inoculated (Laguerre et al., 2003). Nodules produced by strain on one legumes host may have no resemblance to nodules produced by the same strain on another host in the same cross-inoculation group (Mahajan and Gupta, 2009) (Table 6).

The nodule dry weight was ranged between 0.091 to 0.043 g, and plant inoculated with isolates AUGPR12 (grass pea) and AULR1 (lentil) on wolki variety whereas, 0.017 to 0.001gm/ plant by isolates AUFBR2 and AUFBR3 (faba bean) on Hachallu variety accordingly (Table 6). There was a discrepancy in nodule number and weight among the inoculated plants at $P < 0.01$.

Maximum mean shoot dry mass (4.04g/plant) was recorded by isolate AUGPR13 (grass pea) on Hachallu variety and 3.11 g/plant with isolate AUFBR5 (faba bean) on wolki variety. The minimum shoot dry mass was recorded by plant inoculated with isolates AUFBR5 (faba bean) and AULR17 (lentil) (2.60g/PI) on Hachallu and 1.74 g/pl by isolate AULR17 (lentil) on wolki variety. This result supported by previous findings of Talukder et al. (2008) in such a way that shoot dry weight was influenced by rhizobium inoculation. In this experiment, a significant difference in shoot dry weight among the isolates from cross inoculated hosts was recorded at $p < 0.01$ (Table 6).

The relative symbiotic effectiveness among the test isolates from heterogeneous cross-inoculation hosts were evaluated on the basis of the shoot dry matter accumulation by the infected host plants in reference to the nitrogen-fertilized control (Purcino et al., 2000) (Table 7). From faba bean, isolate AUFBR2 was highly

Table 6. Comparative evaluation of symbiotic effectiveness of the modulated isolates with both Hachallu and Wolki varieties of faba bean.

Isolates	Host of isolate	NN/pl		NDW/pl (g)		SDW/pl (g)		% SE		Rate	
		HV	WV	HV	WV	HV	WV	HV	WV	HV	WV
AUFBR2	Faba bean	112 ^e	106 ^{f-h}	0.001 ^{b-e}	0.045 ^b	3.32 ^{a-d}	2.63 ^a	82	99	HE	HE
AUFBR3	Faba bean	65 ^{bc}	103 ^{e-h}	0.017 ^{b-f}	0.074 ^{c-e}	3.14 ^{a-d}	2.98 ^a	77	112	E	HE
AUFBR5	Faba bean	112 ^e	122 ^h	0.004 ^{a-c}	0.058 ^{b-d}	2.60 ^{a-d}	3.11 ^{bc}	64	117	E	HE
(+) control	-	-	-	-	-	4.06 ^d	2.66 ^a	-	-	-	-
(-) control	-	-	-	-	-	1.58 ^{ab}	0.72 ^a	-	-	-	-
AUFPR6	Field pea	45 ^b	91 ^{d-g}	0.002 ^{ab}	0.068 ^{b-e}	3.25 ^{a-d}	2.08 ^a	89	52	HE	E
AUFPR7	Field pea	73 ^{b-d}	110 ^{gh}	0.012 ^{a-d}	0.074 ^{c-e}	2.91 ^{a-d}	2.94 ^a	81	115	HE	HE
AUFPR10	Field pea	67 ^{bc}	87 ^{d-g}	0.016 ^{a-e}	0.065 ^{b-e}	3.09 ^{a-d}	2.65 ^a	85	104	HE	HE
(+) control	-	-	-	-	-	3.61 ^{b-d}	2.55 ^a	-	-	-	-
(-) control	-	-	-	-	-	1.68 ^{a-c}	1.03 ^a	-	-	-	-
AUGPR12	Grass pea	105 ^{de}	90 ^{d-g}	0.008 ^{b-f}	0.091 ^e	3.36 ^{a-d}	2.90 ^b	82	94	HE	HE
AUGPR13	Grass pea	70 ^{b-d}	41 ^b	0.005 ^{d-f}	0.053 ^{bc}	4.04 ^d	2.13 ^a	98	69	HE	E
AUGPR14	Grass pea	131 ^e	46 ^{bc}	0.015 ^{ef}	0.058 ^{b-d}	3.67 ^{b-d}	2.71 ^a	89	87	HE	HE
(+) control	-	-	-	-	-	4.11 ^d	3.10 ^{bc}	-	-	-	-
(-) control	-	-	-	-	-	1.57 ^{ab}	1.07 ^a	-	-	-	-
AULR16	Lentil	60 ^b	63 ^{b-d}	0.010 ^{b-f}	0.043 ^b	2.82 ^{a-d}	2.50 ^a	74	92	E	HE
AULR17	Lentil	54 ^b	72 ^{c-e}	0.014 ^{c-f}	0.086 ^e	2.60 ^{a-d}	1.74 ^a	68	64	E	E
AULR18	Lentil	103 ^{c-e}	76 ^{c-f}	0.003 ^f	0.081 ^{de}	2.77 ^{a-d}	2.64 ^a	72	97	E	HE
(+) control	-	-	-	-	-	3.82 ^{cd}	2.73 ^a	-	-	-	-
(-) control	-	-	-	-	-	1.31 ^a	0.83 ^a	-	-	-	-

HV=hachallu variety, WV=wolki variety of faba bean, PI=plant, NN=nodule number, NDW=nodule dry weight, SDW=shoot dry weight, SE=symbiotic effectiveness

Table 7. The relative symbiotic effectiveness of the isolates from heterogeneous cross-inoculation host on two varieties of faba bean.

Host of isolate	Hachallu variety of faba bean		Wolki variety of faba bean	
	Effective	Highly effective	Effective	Highly effective
Faba bean	AUFBR3, AUFBR5	AUFBR2	-	AUFBR2, AUFBR3 and AUFBR5
Total	2	1	-	3
Percentage (%)	66.7	33.3	-	100
Field pea	-	AUFPR6, AUFPR7, AUFPR10	AUFPR6	AUFPR7, AUFPR10
Total	-	3	1	2
Percentage (%)	-	100	33.3	66.7
Grass pea	-	AUGPR12, AUGPR13, AUGPR14	AUGPR13	AUGPR12, AUGPR14
Total	-	3	1	2
Percentage (%)	-	100	33.3	66.7
Lentil	AULR16, AULR17, AULR18	-	AULR17	AAULR16, AAULR18
Total	3	-	1	2
Percentage (%)	100	-	33.3	66.7

effective; isolates AUFBR3 and AUFBR5 were effective on Hachallu variety whereas, all isolates were highly effective on wolki variety. All isolates of Field pea were highly effective on Hachallu variety whereas, isolates AUFPR7 and AUFPR10 were highly effective and isolate AUFPR6 was effective on Wolki variety.

Similarly, all isolates of grass pea were highly effective

on Hachallu variety, and isolate AUGPR12 and AUGPR14 were highly effective with 1 isolate (AUGPR13) effective on wolki variety. All isolates of lentil were effective on Hachallu variety and 2 isolates (AULR16 and AULR18) and 1 isolate (AULR16) were highly effective and effective on wolki variety respectively (Table 7). This result indicated that *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* isolated

Table 8. Summary of physiological and symbiotic properties of Isolates from faba bean, field pea, grass pea and lentil.

Isolates	Host	Range of salt (%)	Range of pH	Range of T (°C)	% SE		Rate	
					HV	WV	HV	WV
AUFBR2	Faba bean	1-10	4.5-12	5-40	82	99	HE	HE
AUFBR3	Faba bean	1-3	4.5-9	5-45	77	112	E	HE
AUFBR5	Faba bean	1-6	4-12	10-35	64	117	E	HE
AUFPR6	Field pea	1-8	4-9.5	15-35	89	52	HE	E
AUFPR7	Field pea	1-7	5-12	5-35	81	115	HE	HE
AUFPR10	Field pea	1- 2	4.5-11	15-40	85	104	HE	HE
AUGPR12	Grass pea	1-3	4-10.5	5-45	82	94	HE	HE
AUGPR13	Grass pea	1-10	4-12	10-40	98	69	HE	E
AUGPR14	Grass pea	1-10	4-12	5-45	89	87	HE	HE
AULR16	Lentil	1-7	5-11	15-35	74	92	E	HE
AULR17	Lentil	1-4	4.5-9.5	15-40	68	64	E	E
AULR18	Lentil	1-9	4-11	5-45	72	97	E	HE

T=temperature, HV=hachallu variety of faba bean, WV=wolki variety of faba bean; SE=symbiotic effectiveness, HE=highly effective, E=effective.

from different host legumes showed variation in symbiotic effectiveness on faba bean varieties. The result is similar with that of Shimeket et al. (2008) who reported variation in symbiotic effectiveness from a population of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* on vetch from different soils. Laguerre et al. (2003) reported that specific symbiotic plasmid-encoded genes showed variation in competition for modulating of faba beans and nitrogen-fixing effectiveness.

Generally, isolates of AUFBR2 (faba bean) and AUGPR14 (grass pea) were highly effective in both hachallu and wolki varieties, and showed tolerance wide range of salt, pH, and temperature than their cross-inoculation group of *R. leguminosarum* var *viciae* (Table 8). These remarkable features of isolates are very important for screen, and it's shown to be competitive for future inoculants legumes production under extreme environmental conditions at the field trials in the soil ecosystem.

Conclusion

The present study shows the physiological and symbiotic diversity of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* isolates of faba bean, field pea, grass pea, and lentil. Some of the isolates showed tolerant to a wider range of salt, pH, and temperature. Twelve isolates of faba bean, field pea, grass pea, and lentil were cross inoculated and induced nodules on faba bean host. Isolates from different cross-inoculated were effective irrespective of their host from which they isolate. The symbiotic effectiveness of isolates showed a significant difference on Hachallu variety (64 to 98% SE) and Wolki variety (52 to 117% SE). Isolates of AUFBR2 (faba bean) and AUGPR14 (grass pea) were best matched with both hachallu and wolki varieties followed by isolates AUFPR2 (field pea) and AUGPR3

(grass pea). This matching of rhizobial isolates to host legume is one of the most important factors in maximizing productivity and full expression of N₂ fixation in stressed environmental condition.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Isolates of AUFBR2 (faba bean), isolate AUGPR14 (grass pea), AUGPR13 (grass pea) and AUFPR7 (field pea) must be used to develop inoculants as they are ecologically competitive. Screening isolates genetically using molecular techniques of REP/PCR or RFLP/PCR to evaluate their effectiveness under different environmental conditions.

CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

The authors have not declared any conflict of interests.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author's gratefully thank the Addis Ababa University (AAU) Department of Microbial, Cellular and Molecular Biology for the financial support of this research work.

REFERENCES

- Adal M (2009). Phenotypic and Symbiotic characterization of grass pea (*Lathyrus sativus*) rhizobial isolates from some major growing areas of South Wollo and West Shoa, Ethiopia. MSc. Thesis. Addis Ababa University, Ethiopia.
- Adamu A, Assefa F, Hailemariam A, Bekele E (2001). Studies of Rhizobium inoculation and fertilizer treatment on growth and production of faba bean (*Vicia faba*) in some yield depleted and yield sustained regions of Semien Showa. SINET: Ethiop. J. Sci. 24:197-211.

- Adler K (2008). Exploring the implications of introducing inoculated legumes in southern Ethiopia: A systemic analysis of the factors affecting farmer adoption and nitrogen synchrony. M.Sc. thesis, Norwegian University of life Sciences, Norway. Available at: <http://oe.confolio.org/scam/34/resource/162>
- Amara DS (1990). Evidence of cross-inoculation among the fast-growing tree legumes used in agroforestry. In: Nitrogen Fixation: Achievement and Objectives. (Gresshoff PM, Roth LE, Stacy G and Newton WE. eds). Chapman Hall, New York. P 645.
- Amsalu A (2007). Symbiotic and Phenotypic Characterization of Rhizobium leguminosarum biovar viciae isolates of Field Pea (*Pisum sativum*) from Different Pulse Growing Regions of Ethiopia. M.Sc. Thesis. Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa.
- Belay Z (2006). Symbiotic and phenotypic diversity of *Rhizobium leguminosarum* var *viciae* Isolates (*Vicia faba*) from Northern Gondar, Ethiopia. Msc. Thesis. AA.University, pp. 7-8.
- Belay Z, Assefa F (2011). Symbiotic and phenotypic diversity of Rhizobium leguminosarum bv. Viciae from Northern Gondar, Ethiopia. Afr. J. Biotechnol. 10(21):4372-4379.
- Bernal G, Graham PH (2001). Diversity in the rhizobia associated with *Phaseolus vulgaris* L. in Ecuador, and comparisons with Mexican bean rhizobia. Can. J. Microbiol. 47:526-534.
- Brockwell J (1998). Matching rhizobia and temperate species of Acacia. In: Recent Development in Acacia planting. (Turn bull, LW, Crompton, HR and Pinyopusarek K. eds). ACIAR, Canberra, Australia pp. 264-273.
- Central Statistics Authority (CSA) (2000). Agricultural Sample Survey. 2000/2001. Report on area and production for major crops. Central Statistical Authority, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Stat. Bull. P 245.
- Central Statistics Authority (CSA) (2005). Agricultural Sampling Survey 2004/2005. Report On Area and Production for Major Crops, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia pp. 22-34.
- Central Statistics Authority (CSA) (2015). The federal democratic republic of Ethiopia central statistical agency agricultural sample survey 2014/2015. Area and production of major crops (Private peasant holdings, Meher season). Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Central Statistical Agency P 19.
- Demissie N (2006). Genetic diversity and characterization of indigenous *Rhizobium leguminosarum* biovar *vicia* isolates of cool-season food Legumes grown in the highlands of Ethiopia. Ph.D. Thesis, University of Putra, Malaysia pp. 26-35.
- Fano B (2010). Phenotypic and Symbiotic characteristics of Rhizobia nodulating field Pea (*Pisum sativum* L.) in southern Tigray, Ethiopia, M.Sc. Thesis. Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa.
- Gebremariam G (2007). Characterization and evaluation of nitrogen fixation of Rhizobium leguminosarum bv. Viciae isolates collected from different parts of Ethiopia. MSc. Thesis. Addis Ababa University, Ethiopia.
- Giller KE (2001). Nitrogen fixation in tropical cropping systems 2nd ed. CABI, international, Wallingford.
- Hailemariam A, Tsigie A (2006). Symbiotic nitrogen fixation research on food legumes in Ethiopia. In: Proceedings of a Workshop on Food and Forage Legumes (Kemal A, Gemechu K, Seid A, Rajendra M, Surendra B, and Khaled M eds). ICARDA, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. pp. 172-176.
- Hailemariam A, Tsigie A (2006). Symbiotic nitrogen fixation research on food legumes in Ethiopia. In: Proceedings of a Workshop on Food and Forage Legumes (Kemal A, Gemechu K, Seid A, Rajendra M, Surendra B, and Khaled M eds). ICARDA, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. pp. 172-176.
- Handley BA, Hedges AJ, Beringer JE (1998). Importance of host plants for detecting the population diversity of Rhizobium leguminosarum biovar viciae in soil. Soil Biol. Biochem. 30:241-249.
- Ihsanullah D, Hasan S, Khan BM, Gul H, Ijaz AKH (2008). Effect of Different Levels of Nitrogen on Dry Matter and Grain Yield of Faba Bean (*Vicia faba* L.). Pak. J. Bot. 40(6):2453-2459.
- Jensen ES, Peoples M, Hauggaard-Nielsen H (2010). Review: faba beans in cropping systems. Field Crop Res. 115:203-216.
- Jordan D (1984). Rhizobaceae. In: Bergey's Manual of Systematic Bacteriology. (Hendricks DP, Sneath HA and Halt JH, eds). Orient Longman, New York pp. 234-256.
- Keneni A, Assefa F, Prabu P (2010). Characterization of acid and salt tolerant Rhizobial strains isolated from Faba bean Fields of Wollo, Northern Ethiopia. J. Agric. Sci. Technol. 12:365-376.
- Laguerre G, Louvrier P, Allard MR, Amarger N (2003). Compatibility of Rhizobial Genotypes within Natural Populations of Rhizobium leguminosarum Biovar viciae for Nodulation of Host Legumes. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 69(4):2276-2283.
- Lo´pez-Bellido L, Lo´pez-Bellido RJ, Redondo R, Benítez J (2006). Faba bean nitrogen fixation in a wheat-based rotation under rainfed Mediterranean conditions: effect of tillage system. Field Crops Res. 98:253-260.
- Lupwayi N, Haque I (1994). Legume-Rhizobium Technology Manual. Environmental Sciences Division International Livestock Center for Africa. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia pp. 1-93.
- Mahajan A, Gupta RD (2009). International Nutrient Management in Sustainable Rice Wheat Cropping System. Springer Science and Business Media B.V., India pp. 79-80.
- Martinez-Romero E, Segovia L, Mercante FM, Franco AA, Graham P, Pardo MA (1991). Rhizobium tropici, a novel species nodulating Phaseolus vulgaris L. beans and Leucaena sp trees. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. 41:417-426.
- McVicar R, Panchuk K, Brenzil C, Hartley S, Pearse P (2005). Faba bean in Saskatchewan. Saskatchewan Agriculture, Food, and Rural Revitalization. University of Saskatchewan, Vandenberg P 11.
- Mulongoy K (2004). Technical paper 2: Biological nitrogen fixation. Can. J. Microbiol. 21:1-19.
- Nikfarjam SG, Aminpanah H (2015). Effects of phosphorus fertilization and Pseudomonas fluorescence strain on the growth and yield of faba bean (*Vicia faba* L.). IDESIA 33(4):5-21.
- People MD (1995). Biological nitrogen fixation: An efficient source of nitrogen for Sustainable Agricultural production. J. Soil Sci. 174:3-8.
- Purcino HMA, Festin PM, Elkan GH (2000). Identification of effective strains of Brad rhizobium for Archis Pinto. Trop. Agric. 77:226-231.
- Salunkhe DK, Kadam SS (1989). Handbook of world food legumes. In: Nutrition chemistry, processing technology, and utilization. Boca Rotan, Florida: CRC press, Inc. P. 310.
- Shimekit F, Mengistu A, and Assefa F (2008). Pattern of Nodulation and Nitrogen Fixing Performance of Some Introduced Forage Legumes of Ethiopia. Ethiop. J. Nat. Resour. 10:161-176.
- Siddique KH, Johansen C, Turner NC, Jeuffroy MH, Hashem A, Sakar D, Gan Y, Alghamdi SS (2012). Innovations in agronomy for food legumes: a review. Agron. Sustain. Dev. 32:45-64.
- Somasegaren P, Hoben HJ (1994). Handbook for Rhizobia: Methods in legume rhizobium technology. Springer-Verlay, New York.
- Talukder MS, Solaiman A, Khanam D, Rabbani MG (2008). Characterization of Some Rhizobium Isolates and Their Effectiveness on Pea. Bangl. J. Microbiol. 25:45-48.
- Tesfaye G (2008). Symbiotic and phenotypic diversity of rhizobial isolates nodulating Vicia faba from western Shoa and Hararghe, Ethiopia. M.Sc. Thesis. Addis Ababa University, Ethiopia.
- Teshome Z (2006). Numerical taxonomy of phenotypic characters of *Rhizobium leguminosarum* var *viciae* isolates from the major pulse producing regions of Ethiopia and its importance for predictive ecological and symbiotic studies. MSc. Thesis. Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa.
- Tran LSP, Nguyen HT (2009). Future Biotechnology of Legumes. In: Emerich WD, and Krishnan H, eds., Nitrogen Fixation in Crop Production, The American Society of Agronomy, Crop Science Society of America and Soil Science Society of America, Madison pp. 265-308.
- Vincent JM (1970). A Manual for the Practical Study of Root Nodule Bacteria. Blackwell Scientific Publications, Oxford P 164.
- White D (1995). The physiology and biochemistry of prokaryotes. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Yohannes D (2000). Faba bean (*Vicia faba*) in Ethiopia. Institute of biodiversity, conservation and Research (IBCR), Addis Ababa, Ethiopia P 43.
- Zhang X, Kosier B, and Priefer UB (2001). Symbiotic plasmid rearrangement in *Rhizobium leguminosarum* bv. Viciae VF39SM. J. Bacteriol. 183: 2141-2144.